

Watford Borough Council Audit Committee Progress Report 26 June 2013

Recommendation

Members are recommended to:

- Note the Internal Audit Progress Report for the period to 31 May 2013
- Agree removal of implemented recommendations (Appendices B)

Contents

1 Introduction and Background 1.1 Purpose 1.2-1.4 Background

2 Audit Plan Update 2.1-2.3 Delivery of Audit Plan and Key Findings 2.4-2.6 All Priority Recommendations 2.7 Proposed audit plan amendments 2.8- 2.9Performance against targets

Appendices

- A Progress against the 2013-14 Audit Plan
- B Progress against outstanding internal audit recommendations

1. Introduction and Background

Purpose of Report

- 1.1 This report details:
 - a) Progress made by the Shared Internal Audit Service (SIAS) in delivering the Council's annual audit plan for 2013/14 as at 31 May 2013.
 - b) Progress on finalisation of the 2012/13 audit plan as at 31 May 2013.
 - c) Implementation status of all outstanding previously agreed audit recommendations from 2010/11 onwards.
 - d) An update on performance management information as at 31 May 2013.

Background

- 1.2 The work of internal audit is required to be reported to a Member Body so that the Council has an opportunity to review and monitor an essential component of corporate governance and gain assurance that its internal audit provision is fulfilling its statutory obligations. It is considered good practice that progress reports also include proposed amendments to the agreed annual audit plan.
- 1.3 The Internal audit service has been transferred to the Shared Internal Audit Service (SIAS) partnership since April 2013. The 2013/14 draft annual audit plan was presented to the Audit Committee by the Head of Assurance (SIAS) and approved by the Audit Committee on 13 March 2013.
- 1.4 The Audit Committee will receive quarterly updates against the annual audit plan from SIAS, and this is the first such report. Previously the Committee received progress reports from the in-house audit team, the last of which was brought to this Committee on 13 March 2013.

2. Audit Plan Update

Delivery of Audit Plan and Key Audit Findings

- 2.1 As at 31 May 2013, 98.3% of the audits from the 2012/13 revised audit plan have been completed. The annual report also on the Audit Committee agenda of 26 June provides a full status update on each individual project within the audit plan.
- 2.2 The following 2012-13 reports have been finalised in the period between 13 March 2013 to 3 June 2013:

| Audit Title | Date of Issue | Assurance Level | Number and Priority of Recommendations |
|------------------------|------------------|--------------------|---|
| Data Protection | 18.03.13 | Satisfactory | Five recommendations, medium priority. |
| Carbon Management | 03.05.13 | Substantial | No recommendations made. |
| Accounts Payable | 07.05.13 | Substantial | Two recommendations, medium priority. |
| Partnerships | 15.05.13 | Satisfactory | Five recommendations, medium priority. |
| Risk Management | 17.05.13 | Satisfactory | Three recommendations, medium priority. |
| Sundry Debtors | 20.05.13 | Satisfactory | Two recommendations, one high and one medium priority |
| FMS Reconciliations | 21.0513 | Satisfactory | Five recommendations one high, three medium and one low priority. |

| NNDR | 24.05.13 | Satisfactory | Four |
|-------------|----------|--------------|------------------|
| | | | recommendations, |
| | | | two high and two |
| | | | medium priority. |
| Council Tax | 24.05.13 | Satisfactory | Four |
| | | | recommendations, |
| | | | two high and two |
| | | | medium priority. |

2.3 Work on the 2013/14 audit plan is underway, at an early stage. Appendix A sets out the status of each item within the 2013/14 plan.

Recommendations

- 2.4 Members will be aware that a Final Audit Report is issued when it has been agreed by management; this includes an agreement to implement the recommendations that have been made. It is SIAS's responsibility to bring to Members' attention the implementation status of high priority recommendations; it is the responsibility of Officers to implement the recommendations by the agreed date.
- 2.5 The table below summarises progress in implementation of all outstanding internal audit recommendations, with full detail given in appendix B:

| Year | Recommendations | Implemented | Not | Outstanding | Percentage |
|---------|-----------------|-------------|-----|-------------|-------------|
| | made | | yet | & request | implemented |
| | No. | | due | made for | % |
| | | | | extended | |
| | | | | time | |
| 2010/11 | 213 | 207 | 0 | 6 | 97% |
| 2011/12 | 114 | 108 | 5 | 1 | 94.7% |
| 2012/13 | 42 | 9 | 32 | 1 | 21.4% |

2.6 Many of the IT audit recommendations dating back to 2010 are being actioned by the ICT Client Manager as part of the transfer of IT to the new provider. Extended time for implementation has been requested for 6 of the recommendations by ICT, one by the Finance Service and one by Environmental Services.

Proposed Audit Plan Amendments

2.7 At the 13 March Audit Committee, members commented on the risk assessment approach and those audits deferred to future years. To date, the focus of the team has been in completing work from the 12/13 plan and no discussion has yet taken place with regards to re-assessing the priorities for the current year plan. This will be kept under review at audit liaison meetings and any changes reported back to this Committee.

Performance against targets

2.8 Annual performance indicators and associated targets were approved by the SIAS Board in March 2013. Actual performance for Watford Borough Council against the targets that can be monitored for 2013/14 is shown the table below.

| Performance Indicator | Annual Target | Profiled Target to 31 May 2013 | Actual to 31 May 2013 |
|--|------------------|--|--------------------------|
| 1. Planned Days – percentage of actual billable days against planned chargeable days completed (excluding unused contingency) | 95% | 17% | 13.2% |
| 2. Planned Projects – percentage of actual completed projects to draft report stage against planned completed projects (excludes 12/13 completion and 'ongoing' pieces) | 95% | 17% | 8.8% |

| 3. Client Satisfaction – percentage of client satisfaction questionnaires | 100% | 100% | No 13/14 reports issued |
|---|------|------|--|
| returned at 'satisfactory' level | | | |
| 4. Number of High Priority Audit Recommendations agreed | 95% | 100% | No 13/14 high priority recommendations yet made |

- 2.9 In addition, the performance targets listed below are annual in nature. Performance against these targets will be reported on in the 2013-14 Head of Assurance's Annual Report:
 - **5. External Auditors' Satisfaction** the Annual Audit Letter should formally record whether or not the External Auditors are able to rely upon the range and the quality of SIAS' work.
 - 6. Annual Plan prepared in time to present to the March meeting of each Audit Committee. If there is no March meeting then the plan should be prepared for the first meeting of the civic year.
 - **7. Head of Assurance's Annual Report** presented at the Audit Committee's first meeting of the civic year.

2013-14 SIAS Audit Plan

| | LEVEL OF | F | | | AUDIT PLAN | LEAD AUDITOR | BILLABLE DAYS | STATUS/COMMENT |
|--------------------------|---------------------|---|---|----|---------------|-----------------|------------------|---------------------|
| | ASSURANCE | н | М | MA | | ASSIGNED | | STATUS/COMMENT |
| Key Financial Systems | | | | | | | | |
| Benefits (shared) | Not yet assessed | | | | 15 | No | | Planned for Q3 / Q4 |
| Council Tax (shared) | Not yet assessed | | | | 12 | No | | Planned for Q3 / Q4 |
| Creditors (shared) | Not yet assessed | | | | 11 | No | | Planned for Q3 / Q4 |
| Debtors (shared) | Not yet assessed | | | | 11 | No | | Planned for Q3 / Q4 |
| Main Accounting (shared) | Not yet assessed | | | | 19 | No | | Planned for Q3 / Q4 |
| NNDR (shared) | Not yet assessed | | | | 12 | No | | Planned for Q3 / Q4 |
| Payroll (shared) | Not yet assessed | | | | 14 | No | | Planned for Q3 / Q4 |
| Treasury Management | Not yet assessed | | | | 5 | No | | Quarter TBC |
| Budgetary Control | Not yet assessed | | | | 8 | No | | Quarter TBC |

| | LEVEL OF | F | REC | S | | | BILLABLE DAYS | |
|--|---------------------|---|-----|----|--------------|---------------------|------------------|----------------|
| | ASSURANCE | Н | М | MA | PLAN DAYS | AUDITOR ASSIGNED | COMPLETED | STATUS/COMMENT |
| Asset Management | Not yet assessed | | | | 8 | No | | Quarter TBC |
| Operational Audits | | | | | | | | |
| Recruitment and vetting – follow-up (Shared) | Not yet assessed | | | | 5 | Yes | 1 | Planned for Q1 |
| Health & Safety (Shared) | Not yet assessed | | | | 10 | Yes | | Planned for Q1 |
| Project and change management | Not yet assessed | | | | 10 | Yes | | Planned for Q2 |
| Housing re-design –advisory support | Not yet assessed | | | | 10 | Yes | 1 | Planned for Q1 |
| Review of Corporate Spatial Data | Not yet entered | | | | 10 | Yes | 1 | Planned for Q1 |
| Health Campus | Not yet entered | | | | 10 | No | | Planned for Q2 |
| Commercial rent | Not yet assessed | | | | 6 | Yes | | Planned for Q1 |
| Data Protection –follow-up | Not yet assessed | | | | 6 | Yes | | Planned for Q3 |
| | | | | | | | | |

| | LEVEL OF | | | | | LEAD AUDITOR | BILLABLE DAYS | STATUS/COMMENT |
|---|---------------------|----------|---|----------|------|-----------------|------------------|----------------|
| | ASSURANCE | н | м | MA | DAYS | ASSIGNED | | |
| Procurement | | | | | | | | |
| New IT contract management review (shared) | Not yet assessed | | | | 10 | No | | January 2014 |
| Procurement and contract management baseline review | Not yet assessed | | | | 10 | Yes | | Planned for Q3 |
| Outsourcing arrangements | Not yet assessed | | | | 10 | No | | Quarter TBC |
| Counter Fraud | | | | | | | | |
| Review of counter fraud arrangements Shared Service Benefit Fraud Team (shared) | Not yet assessed | | | | 5 | No | | Quarter TBC |
| Anti-Fraud and Corruption Baseline Review | Not yet assessed | | | | 10 | Yes | | Planned for Q1 |
| Risk Management and Governance | | <u> </u> | | <u> </u> | | | | |
| Risk management | Not yet assessed | | | | 5 | No | | Quarter TBC |
| Corporate governance | Not yet assessed | | | | 5 | No | | Quarter TBC |

| AUDITABLE AREA | LEVEL OF | RECS | | AUDIT PLAN | | BILLABLE DAYS | STATUS/COMMENT | |
|---|---------------------|------|---|---------------|------|------------------|----------------|----------------|
| | ASSURANCE | Н | м | MA | DAYS | | COMPLETED | STATUS/COMMENT |
| | | | | | | | | |
| IT Audits | | | | | | | | |
| IT vulnerabilities- extended follow-up (shared) | Not yet assessed | | | | 10 | No | | August 2013 |
| Cyber Risk (Shared) | Not yet assessed | | | | 10 | No | | October 2013 |
| SIAS Joint Work | | | • | | | | | |
| New ways working seminar (Shared) | Not yet assessed | | | | 1 | | | Quarter TBC |
| Comparative review of budget setting and monitoring arrangements (Shared) | Not yet assessed | | | | 1 | | | Quarter TBC |
| Herts waste partnership | Not yet assessed | | | | 1 | | | Quarter TBC |
| Contingency | | | | | | | | |
| Investigation | Not yet entered | | | | 2 | | 4 | In progress |
| Boundary way insulation project | Not yet entered | | | | 0 | Yes | 1 | Complete |
| | | | | | | | | |

| AUDITABLE AREA | LEVEL OF | | | AUDIT PLAN | | BILLABLE DAYS | STATUS/COMMENT | |
|---|--------------|---|---|---------------|------|------------------|----------------|---|
| | ASSURANCE | Н | М | MA | DAYS | ASSIGNED | | STATUS/COMMENT |
| Strategic Support | | | | | | | | |
| Head of Internal Audit Opinion 2012/13 | Satisfactory | | | | 2 | | 2 | Complete |
| Introduction to Public Sector Internal Audit Standards | N/A | | | | 1 | | 1 | Complete |
| Audit committee | N/A | | | | 8 | | 1 | Ongoing |
| Monitoring & Client Liaison | N/A | | | | 5 | | 1 | Ongoing |
| 2014/15 Audit Planning | N/A | | | | 3 | | | Ongoing |
| SIAS Development | N/A | | | | 3 | | | Ongoing |
| Follow-up recommendations | N/A | | | | 10 | | 1 | Ongoing |
| Completion of 2012-13 audits | | | | | | | | |
| Time required to complete work commenced in 2012/13 | Various | | | | 24 | | 28 | Two pieces of 12/13 work remain at draft report stage |
| WBC TOTAL | | | | | 148 | | 13 | |
| SHARED SERVICES TOTAL | | | | | 170 | | 29 | |
| COMBINED TOTAL | | | | | 318 | | 42 | |

Key: H = High Priority recommendation M= Medium Priority recommendation MA= Merits Attention Priority recommendation N/A = Not Applicable

Note:

For purposes of performance indicator on planned projects: Number of deliverables = 34 pieces (does not include ongoing pieces or completion of 12/13 activity)